International Journal of ELECTROCHEMICAL SCIENCE www.electrochemsci.org

# Effect of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> Concentration on the Corrosion Behaviour of X80 Pipeline Steel in Simulated Soil Solution

Fei Xie, Dan Wang<sup>\*</sup>, Chengxiang Yu, Yue Zong, Ming Wu

Key Laboratory of Oil & Gas Storage and Transportation, College of Petroleum Engineering, Liaoning Shihua University, Fushun Liaoning, 113001, China. \*E-mail: <u>wd841015@163.com</u>

Received: 20 June 2017 / Accepted: 3 August 2017 / Published: 12 September 2017

In buried pipeline steel, soil environmental factors cause corrosion, which greatly affects the safe operation of pipe networks. The effects of  $HCO_3^-$  on the corrosion behaviour of X80 pipeline steel in Liaohe Oilfield simulated soil solution was investigated through potentiodynamic polarization and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy. The corrosion morphologies were observed by a metalloscope under different  $HCO_3^-$  concentrations. Accordingly, the polarization curves of the X80 pipeline steel exhibited the typical characteristics of activated passivation in the solution. With increasing  $HCO_3^-$  concentration, the corrosion rate of X80 steel increased and then decreased. The different anodic-current peaks obtained were caused by the property changes of the surface corrosion products of the electrode. When the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration was 0.2 mol/L, the metal corrosion reaction was disrupted. The surface corrosion phenomenon was not obvious and produced only few minor corrosion pits. In this case, the X80 pipeline steel showed the highest corrosion resistance, which was due to the widest passivation interval at this time, and the passivation film was complete and the densest. Thus, the best film protection was attained for the metal electrodes.

Keywords: X80 pipeline steel, bicarbonate ion, corrosion behaviour, Liaohe oilfield soil

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

Long-distance oil and gas transportation have become increasingly common with rising energy demand. Therefore, using high-grade steel pipes has inevitably become the trend in developing pipelines for petroleum and natural gas [1-4]. Given its excellent weldability, high impact toughness, and high resistance to stress corrosion cracking, X80 steel is the preferred steel for manufacturing natural gas pipelines, and its application prospect is extensive [5-10]. Oil and gas pipelines are usually buried deeply and span long distances. Thus, these pipelines are easily affected by soil factors

throughout their service lives and may undergo corrosion. As a contributing factor, high soil  $HCO_3^$ levels may cause varying degrees of corrosion in pipeline steel[11-15]. Domestic and foreign scholars have conducted research on the effect of the  $HCO_3^-$  io n on corrosion, but the views are not unified. In particular, Qiqi Gu [16] indicated that  $HCO_3^-$  ions first restrain and then promote corrosion in X80 pipeline steel, and steel matrix surface corrosion shifts from general to local with the increase of time in NaCl solution. Meanwhile, Yang Zhao et al. [17] showed that in NaHCO<sub>3</sub> solution, the passivation film of X100 and X80 steels generated n-type semiconductor characteristics. In the same study, the surface passivation film was generated through the control mixing mechanism of electromigration and dissolution-deposition. Zhang [18] proposed that the effect of  $Cl^{-}$  and  $SO_4^{2-}$  in  $HCO_3^{-}$  solution on metal corrosion rate is greater than that of  $Cl^{-}$  or  $SO_4^{2-}$  alone. However, scholars abroad and in northwest China study pipeline corrosion more intensively than in northeast China [19-22]. The Liaohe Oilfield is a major oilfield in China that supports the operations of the northeast oil and gas pipeline network. This oilfield is covered by typical alkaline soil with high HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations and erosion, which considerably threaten pipeline integrity. Therefore, this work studied the effect of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration on the corrosion behaviour of X80 pipeline steel in simulated soil solution as corrosion medium. The simulated soil solution was based on the soil 1 m underground of an oil and gas gathering and transportation company in the Liaohe Oilfield.

## 2. EXPERIMENTAL

## 2.1 Experimental materials

The test material was X80 pipeline steel (chemical composition in Table 1) provided by the China National Petroleum Corporation Pipe Research Institute. The X80 steel was processed into 10 mm  $\times$  10 mm  $\times$  2 mm square specimens by wire cutting. A copper wire was drawn by spot welding at the back of sample, leaving a 1 cm<sup>2</sup> working area. The remaining specimens were then coated in Polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) with epoxy resin. Before the experiment, the working electrode was polished from 80# to 1500# with SiC water sand paper and washed with distilled waterand anhydrous ethanol, and then dried.

# 2.2 Experimental medium

The test soil was gathered at about 1 m underground of the courtyard of an oil and gas transportation company in the Liaohe Oilfield. The samples were dried, ground and then mixed with deionised water at a 1:1 ratio to prepare the Liaohe Oilfield simulated soil solution. Physical and chemical data, such as the main components and pH value of the Liaohe Oilfield, were measured by ion chromatography and pH meter. The simulated soil solution was then prepared by analysing the pure drugs NaHCO<sub>3</sub>, CaCl<sub>2</sub>, MgSO<sub>4</sub>, MgCl<sub>2</sub>, NaCl and deionised water under the allocations shown in Table 2. The HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels were adjusted by setting the NaHCO<sub>3</sub> concentrations to 0.072, 0.12, 0.2, 0.3

and 0.5 mol/L. Prior to the experiment, the pH of the simulated solution was adjusted to 8.5 with 5% (volume fraction) NaOH solution and 5% (volume fraction) acetic acid.

## 2.3 Electrochemical experiment

Potentiodynamic polarization curves and alternating current (AC) electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) were tested by a PAR 2273 electrochemical work station and a conventional three-electrode system (X80 steel, Pt, and SCE were used as working, auxiliary, and reference electrodes, respectively). In the test, the working electrode was initially controlled at -1500 mV. The pre-polarization processing lasted for 3 min, the polarization curve scanning range was -1000 mV (vs. SCE) to 200 mV (vs. SCE) and the slow scanning rate was 0.5 mV/s. under the self-corrosion potential ( $E_{corr}$ ), the EIS test frequency range was 10 mHz to 100 kHz, and the impedance amplitude was 10 mV. The surface morphology of the sample after polarization was observed under a Leica DM5200 metallographic microscope. The Origin7.5 software was used to fit the analysis of the polarization curves, and the experimental results were analysed by the ZsimpWin software. The experimental temperature was 298 K (25 °C). To ensure data accuracy, all the experiments were performed in triplicates with good repeatability.

Table 1. Chemical composition of X80 pipeline steel

С	Si	Mn	S	Р	W	Ni	Nb	Ti	Cr	Cu	Al	Fe
0.06	0.08	1.87	0.005	0.006	0.01	0.16	0.044	0.01	0.03	0.26	0.03	residu
%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%	al
Table 2. Composition of simulated soil solution												
	Apellation		NaHCO <sub>3</sub>		CaCl <sub>2</sub>	MgSO <sub>4</sub>		MgCl <sub>2</sub>		NaCl		
	Use level (g/L)		2.731		0.364		0.120 0.306		0.306	2.254		-

## **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

## 3.1 Electrochemical experiments

#### 3.1.1 Polarization measurement

Figure 1 shows the polarization curves of the X80 steel in different  $HCO_3^-$  concentrations in the simulated soil solution. The changes in the corrosion potential of the X80 pipeline steel in the different solutions were not obvious and ranged from -800 mV to -700 mV (vs. SCE). By contrast, the anodic polarization curves varied greatly and showed passivation to different degrees. When the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration was 0.072 mol/L, the anodic polarization curve exhibited active–passive characteristics, and the passive interval was small (-600 mV to -500 mV [vs. SCE]). When the  $HCO_3^-$  level increased to 0.12 mol/L, two anodic current peaks, with the first peak lower than the second,

appeared in the anodic polarization curve. When the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration increased to 0.2 mol/L, the anodic polarization curves showed stable passivation until the potential exceeded –600 mV (vs. SCE), when the anode current density decreased sharply. Between –600 mV to –50 mV (vs. SCE), the anode current curve showed a passivation potential form, and beyond –50 mV (vs. SCE), the anode current increased rapidly and showed passivation characteristics. When the  $HCO_3^-$  continued to rise to 0.3 mol/L, the anodic polarization curves still showed stable passivation characteristics and maintained the passivity potential and current near to those in 0.2 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$ . When  $HCO_3^-$  evel reached 0.5 mol/L, two anodic current peaks, which corresponded to Fe and FeCO<sub>3</sub> dissolution, respectively, were prominent. Then the potentiodynamic polarization curves were fitted, and the results were shown in Table 3. The corrosion current density i<sub>corr</sub> decreased first and then increased with rising  $HCO_3^-$  concentration. When the  $HCO_3^-$  level increased gradually in the simulated solution, reached the peak at 0.2 mol/L and then decreased gradually. The corrosive resistance of X80 pipeline steel increased gradually. The solution.



**Figure 1.** Dynamic potential polarization curves of X80 pipeline steel at different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentrations in the simulated soil solution, which pH was 8.5.

**Table 3.** Corrosion potential and corrosion current density of X80 steel at different  $HCO_3^-$  ion concentration in the simulated soil solution.

HCO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> concentration/(mol/L)	Corrosion potential/V	Corrosion current density/( $\mu$ A/cm <sup>2</sup> )
0.072	-0.76	16.17
0.12	-0.74	9.91
0.2	-0.83	4.52
0.3	-0.81	6.79
0.5	-0.79	9.22

#### 3.1.2 Electrochemical impendence spectroscopy (EIS)

Figure 2 presents an EIS diagram of X80 pipeline steel at different  $HCO_3^-$  concentrations in the simulated soil solution. The high-frequency region of the EIS diagram exhibits an obvious capacitance arc that became vestigial and incomplete in the medium- and low-frequency regions because of dispersion[23]. The larger diameter of the capacitance arc in EIS indicates better resistance against electrochemical corrosion. When the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration increased from 0.072 mol/L to 0.5 mol/L, the capacitance arc diameter increased first and then decreased. When the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration reached 0.2 mol/L, the capacitive arc attained the maximum diameter. This result implies that the resistance in the solution increased gradually and thus inhibited corrosive reaction when the  $HCO_3^-$  rose from 0.072 mol/L to 0.2 mol/L. From 0.2 mol/L to 0.5 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$ , the corrosive resistance in solution decreased gradually and increasingly facilitated corrosive reaction. Hence, the corrosive resistance decreased gradually with increasing  $HCO_3^-$  concentration.



**Figure 2.** Nyquist diagram of X80 pipeline steel at different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentration in the simulated soil solution, which pH was 8.5.



**Figure 3.** Bode curves of X80 pipeline steel at different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentration in the simulated soil solution which pH was 8.5.

Figure 3 shows the Bode curves (curves of phase angle and frequency) of the X80 pipeline steel under different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels in the simulated soil solution. From 0.072 mol/L to 0.5 mol/L  $HCO_3^{-}$ , the curve maintains only one peak, which indicates a time constant in the AC impedance spectrum. Given the characteristics of the self-system, Figure 4 displays the model of equivalent circuit used, in which  $R_s$  is the solution resistance between the working and reference electrodes,  $R_t$  is the charge-transfer resistance and C<sub>dl</sub> is the double-layer capacitance on the electrode surface. In this equivalent circuit, the polarization resistance  $R_p$  is approximately equivalent to the charge-transfer resistance R<sub>t</sub>. The electrochemical parameters were obtained by fitting with time variation (Table 4). Corrosion products formed, caused the electrode surface roughness and diffused. Thus, the element of the constant-phase angle was connected in series on the circuit and represented the element by Q to improve the fitting result. The was obtained through  $Z_{CPE} = [j\omega]^{-n}/Y_0$ , where  $\omega$  is the angular frequency,  $Y_0$  is the admittance constant and n is the diffusion index. The diffusion index n was related to the density and integrity of the product film [24]. Generally, the product film with an n of 0.5–1 is protected to a certain degree, and a larger diffusion index n indicates a stronger matrix protection performance by the corrosion product film [25]. In the fitting results, the charge-transfer resistance  $R_t$ increased constantly from 0.072 mol/L to 0.2 mol/L HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. This finding suggests that the polarization resistance R<sub>p</sub> increased continuously and impeded the corrosive reaction in solution. From 0.2 mol/L to 0.5 mol/L HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, the R<sub>t</sub>, and hence the R<sub>p</sub>, decreased constantly in solution. Thus, the corrosive reaction could easily occur in solution, as similarly indicated by the polarization curves.



**Figure 4.** Equivalent circuit of X80 pipeline steel at different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentration in the simulated soil solution.

HCO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> concentration/(mol/L)	$R_s/(\Omega \cdot cm^2)$	$CPE/(\mu F \cdot cm^2)$	n	$R_t/(\Omega \cdot cm^2)$
0.072	2339	2.372E <sup>-4</sup>	0.8164	20.75
0.12	1867	$1.630E^{-4}$	0.8227	25.95
0.2	2470	$1.692E^{-4}$	0.8557	32.79
0.3	3334	$2.081E^{-4}$	0.8362	24.45
0.5	2782	2.469E <sup>-4</sup>	0.8186	19.63

Table 4. Fitting results of AC impedance

### 3.2 Corrosion morphology

The corrosion surface morphology of the X80 pipeline steel after polarization at different  $HCO_3^-$  levels is presented in Figure 5. Fig. 5 (a) presents a wide area of serious metal surface corrosion with many connected corrosion pits at 0.072 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$ . Meanwhile, the corrosion at 0.12 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$  (b) was high but less severe than in (a) and with small pit diameters of varying sizes. Compared with those in (b), the corrosion pits at 0.2 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$  (c) were significantly fewer, but the area of localised corrosion pits was obviously larger. Meanwhile, the overall corrosion morphology at 0.3 mol/L (d) was basically similar to that in (c), except for the higher number of corrosion pits in the former. Lastly, the overall corrosion morphology at 0.5 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$  (e), including the number and area of localised corrosion pits, increased substantially relative to that in (d). The above-mentioned corrosion trend suggests the protective effect of increasing  $HCO_3^-$  concentration on the metal through a passive film formed on the metal surface. However, as the reaction proceeded, corrosion ensued upon the rupture of the passive film and proceeded along the corrosion pits inwardly. Hence, large-diameter corrosion pits were formed.



**Figure 5.** Surface corrosion morphology of X80 steel under different HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentration in the simulated soil solution, which pH was 8.5. HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ion concentration were (a)0.072mol/L, (b)0.12mol/L, (c)0.2mol/L, (d)0.3mol/L, (e)0.5mol/L.

## 3.3 Mechanism analysis

The anodic-current peak of the potentiodynamic polarization curves of carbon steel at different  $HCO_3^-$  levels in solution might be related to the electrode potential,  $HCO_3^-$  concentration and solution pH[26,27]. That is, at increased electrode potential,  $HCO_3^-$  level and solution pH, the passive film easily formed and the stable passive potential range widened, but the passive film stability worsened.

Because the solution pH was constant throughout the experiment, the anodic peak of potentiodynamic polarization curve was related to the electrode potential and the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration.

At 0.072 mol/L HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, only one anodic-current peak appeared on the polarization curves. The specimen surface only generated a thin layer of Fe(OH)<sub>2</sub> and FeCO<sub>3</sub> surface film[28]. This result was achieved because the HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration was low, and HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> ionisation assumed the dominant role (Eq. 1). The numerous H<sup>+</sup> ions would be generated and consequently lowered the solution pH. However, the Fe(OH)<sub>2</sub> and FeCO<sub>3</sub> attained many defects and were unstable[29]; thus, the Fe(OH)<sub>2</sub> and FeCO<sub>3</sub> surface film may have dissolved in acidic medium. At this point, the activation–dissolution was reflected in the anode region of the polarization curve. The reactive equation is shown in Eqs. (1)–(5). According to the E-PH diagram of Fe-water system[30], when pH was 8.5 and the potential was between -0.7V to -0.8V in the simulated soil solution, Fe was relatively stable, and in alkaline media area, water acted as a reducing agent. Fe reacted with water to form  $Fe(OH)_2$ . This was consistent with the actual reflection.

 $HCO_3^- \to H^+ + CO_3^{2-} \tag{1}$ 

$$Fe + H_2O \rightarrow Fe(OH)_2 + 2H^+ + 2e$$
 (2)

$$Fe + HCO_3^- \rightarrow FeCO_3 + H^+ + 2e$$
 (3)

$$Fe(OH)_2 + 2H^+ \rightarrow Fe^{2+} + 2H_2O \tag{4}$$

$$FeCO_3 + 2H^+ \rightarrow Fe^{2+} + CO_2 + H_2O \tag{5}$$

At 0.12 mol/L  $\text{HCO}_3^-$ , two anodic-current peaks on the anodic polarization curves were noted with increasing  $\text{HCO}_3^-$  level. The different current peaks represent the different Corrosion products produced at this time[31]. The dissolution of the iron matrix corresponded to the first anodic-current peak. The reactive equation is shown in Eq. (3). The FeCO<sub>3</sub> content in the solution increased but did not form a dense Corrosion product film. Thus, the dissolution of FeCO<sub>3</sub> at this point formed a second anode-current peak[32]. The reactive equation is shown in Eq. (6).

$$FeCO_3 + HCO_3^- \rightarrow Fe(CO_3)_2^{2-} + H^+$$
(6)

At 0.2 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$ , most of the anode region of the electrode surface was occupied by  $HCO_3^-$ . At this point, hydrolysis of  $HCO_3^-$  ions resulted in large amounts of OH<sup>-</sup> covering the specimen surface and forming a stable passive film. A larger passivation range indicates a higher corrosion resistance. The reactive equation is presented in Eqs. (7)–(9).

$$HCO_3^- + H_2O \to H_2CO_3 + OH^- \tag{7}$$

$$Fe + 2Fe(OH)_2 + 4OH^- \rightarrow Fe_3O_4 + 4H_2O + 4e$$
 (8)

$$2Fe_3O_4 + H_2O \rightarrow 2Fe_2O_3 + 2H^+ + 2e \tag{9}$$

At 0.3 mol/L HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, the surface passive film dissolved gradually, and the passive interval decreased. That is, the anode also began to dissolve gradually. This result was observed because solution conductivity is positively related to  $HCO_3^-$  concentration. Higher  $HCO_3^-$  concentration resulted in higher solution conductivity and hence, faster migratory velocity between the corrosion film and the solution interface[33,34]. Meanwhile, the high  $HCO_3^-$  concentration accelerated the dissolution of the FeCO<sub>3</sub> product film, which then released a large amount of Fe<sup>2+</sup> into the solution and caused the surface film to further dissolve. Concurrently, partial  $HCO_3^-$  ionisation occurred (Eq. 1)

produced a large amount of  $H^+$ . As a result, some of the Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> and Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> passive films were dissolved by  $H^+$  ions, decreasing the passive interval and the corrosive resistance.

At 0.5 mol/L HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, the surface passive film continued to dissolve because of the adsorption of high HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> levels onto the point defects of the surface matrix film. This phenomenon impeded the migration of the free oxygen in the solution to the oxygenic vacancies[35,36]. Given the lack of oxygen, FeCO<sub>3</sub> film formation was inhibited. Meanwhile, the large number of Fe<sup>2+</sup> retained on the surface matrix film did not participate in the reaction. As a result, the newly generated oxygenic vacancies could not be consumed in time. The passive interval continued to decrease, and the corrosive resistance also decreased.

# 4. CONCLUSIONS

(1) For simulated soil solutions with different  $HCO_3^-$  concentrations, anode polarization curves showed obvious passivation phenomenon. With increasing  $HCO_3^-$  concentration, the corrosion current density of X80 pipeline steel first decreased and then increased, and the metal's corrosion resistance first increased and then decreased. Moreover, the corrosion resistance was highest at 0.2 mol/L  $HCO_3^-$ .

(2) The corrosion product film plays a protective role on X80 steel. With increased  $HCO_3^-$  concentration, the corrosion product film generally thickened and was thoroughly compacted and led to enhanced matrix protection. However, when the  $HCO_3^-$  concentration exceeded 0.02 mol/L, the corrosion product film thinned and the corrosion resistance became poor due to increased solution conductivity and  $HCO_3^-$  adsorption.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported by the National Science Foundation of China (Grant No. 51604150 and 51574147), the Doctor Startup Foundation of Liaoning Province (Grant No. 201601324) and the Talent Scientific Research Fund of LSHU (No. 2016XJJ-032).

## References

- 1. L. Wei, X.L. Pang, M. Zhou, K.W. Gao, Corros. Sci., 121 (2017) 57
- 2. X.G. Li, D.W. Zhang, Z.Y. Liu, Z. Li, C.W. Du, and C.F. Dong, Nature, 527 (2015) 441
- 3. Lerm S, Westphal A, Miethling G. R, Extremophiles, 17 (2003) 311
- 4. S.X. Li, S.R. Yu, H.L. Zeng, Journal of Petroleum Science and Engineering, 65 (2009) 162
- 5. H.X. Wan, D.D. Song, Z.Y. Liu, C.W. Du, X.G. Li, Acta Metall. Sin., 53 (2017) 575
- 6. L. Zhang, W.H. Cao, K.D. Lu, Z. Wang, Y.Y. Xing, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy., 42 (2017) 3389
- 7. D. Wang, F. Xie, M. Wu, G.X. Liu, Y. Zong, X. Li, Metall. Mater. Trans. A., 48A (2017) 2999
- 8. X.R. Guan, D.L. Zhang, J.J. Wang, Y.H. Jin, Y. Li, J. Nat. Gas Sci. Eng., 37 (2017) 199
- 9. Y.F. Wang, G.X. Cheng, Y. Li, Corros. Sci., 111 (2016) 508
- 10. M.C. Yan, S. Yang, J. Xu, C. Sun, T.Q. Wu, C.K. Yu, W. Ke, Acta Metall. Sin., 52 (2016) 1133
- 11. W. Zhao, H. Zhang, Y. Zou, Int. J. Electrochem. Sci., 12 (2017) 679
- 12. F. F Eliyan, A. Alfantazi, Corros. Eng., Sci. Technol., 50 (2015) 178
- 13. Z.Y. Cui, Z.Y. Liu, L.W. Wang, C.W. Du, X.G. Li, J. Mater. Eng. Perform., 24 (2015) 4400
- 14. W. Zhao, Y. Zou, D.X. Xia, Z.D. Zou, Arch. Metall. Mater., 60 (2015) 1009
- 15. M. Zhu, C.W. Du, X.G. Li ,Z.Y. Liu, Corros., 70 (2014) 1181

- 16. Q.Q. Gu, L. Jian, X. L. Zhang, Heat Treat. Met., 8(2015) 179
- 17. Y. Zhao, P. Liang, Y. H. Shi, Journal of Chinese Society for Corrosion and Protection, 6 (2013) 455
- 18. S.Y. Zhang, P. Liang, C.S. Hu, Corros. Prot., 35 (2014) 14
- 19. Z.Y. Liu, W.R. Zheng, L.W. Wang, J. Univ. Sci. Technol. Beijing, 11 (2014) 1483
- 20. Q. Han, W. Li, H. Wang, J. Mater. Eng. Perform., 24 (2016) 1.
- 21. M. Zhu, Z.Y. Liu, C.W. Du, J. Mater. Eng., 43 (2015) 85
- 22. F. Xie, M. Wu, X. Chen, Journal of Central South University (Science and Technology),44 (2013) 424
- M. Wu, F. Xie, X. Chen, Journal of Sichuan University(engineering science edition), 45 (2013) 185
- 24. H.C. Ma, Z.Y. Liu, C.W. Du, Corros. Sci., 100 (2015) 627
- 25. L. Fan, Z.Y. Liu, W.M. Guo, Acta Metall. Sin., 28 (2015) 866
- 26. Z.Y. Liu, X.G. Li, Y.F. Cheng, Electrochim. Acta, 60 (2012) 259
- 27. C. Zhang, Y.F. Cheng, J. Mater. Eng. Perform., 19 (2010) 834
- 28. T.Q. Wu, M.C. Yan, D.C. Zeng, Acta Metall. Sin., 28 (2015) 93
- 29. L. Niu, Y.F. Cheng. Appl. Surf. Sci., 253 (2007) 8626
- 30. X.J Xie, H. Wang, P.G. Zou, L. Pan, Journal of North China Electric Power, 5(2011)23
- 31. J. Ding, Z. Lei, D. Li, J. Mater. Sci., 48 (2013) 3708
- 32. M. Zhu, C. Du, X. Li, J. Mater. Eng. Perform., 23 (2014) 1358
- 33. B.Y. Fang, A. Atrens, J.Q. Wang, J. Mater. Sci., 38 (2003) 127
- 34. L. Fan, Z.Y. Liu, W.M. Guo, Acta Metall. Sin., 28 (2015) 866
- 35. M. Zhu, C. Du, X. Li, J. Mater. Eng. Perform., 23 (2014) 1358
- 36. Marimuthu V., Kannoorpatti K., Journal of Bio- and Tribo-Corrosion, 2 (2016) 29

© 2017 The Authors. Published by ESG (<u>www.electrochemsci.org</u>). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).