Facile Solvothermal Preparation and Electrochemical Properties of Fe-doped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ for Supercapacitors

Qifu Bao, Weixia Dong*, Xingyong Gu, Jijun Shi and Huijuan Shen

Department of Material Science and Engineering, Jingdezhen Ceramic Institute, Jingdezhen, 333001, P. R. China
*E-mail: weixia_dong@sina.com

Received: 20 December 2018 / Accepted: 28 January 2019 / Published: 10 March 2019

Fe-doped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ cathode materials for supercapacitors were synthesized by a facile hydrothermal method. The effects of Fe-doping ion content on the electrochemical performance of CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ were studied by galvanostatic charge/discharge and cyclic voltammetry measurements. The optimal Fe-doping ion content $x$ was 0.06 in a CaFe$_x$Ti$_{2-x}$(OH)$_2$ system. Fe-doped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples exhibited improved cyclic ability, such that the capacity of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ was 964.3 F·g$^{-1}$, which was 3.36-fold higher than the undoped system, at a current density of 10 A·cm$^{-2}$, and had good long-term cycling stability (99.7% retention after 5000 cycles at 10 mA·cm$^{-2}$). The enhanced electrochemical properties of CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ might be ascribed to material morphology, increased electrical conductivity, and structural stability.

Keywords: Fe-doped contents, CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$, electrochemical properties, supercapacitors

1. INTRODUCTION

As a means of bridging the power-energy gap between batteries and traditional capacitors, rechargeable supercapacitors (SC) have attracted interest as an energy storage system due to their high rate capacity and high power density. [1–4] The electrode material is a key component in SCs, because charge generation and transport take place through it. [5–6] Metal oxides and hydroxides have been studied extensively [7–17], however, these materials cannot meet the rapid development of the current information-rich mobile society, due to their relatively low rate capability, cycling stability, or high expense. For example, in a commercial SC, Ru oxide is utilized as the cathode material, but its high cost prevents large-scale use. Therefore, more effort has been invested in exploring novel electrode materials for both cathodes and anodes. [18–21] CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ has a lamellar structure with periodic
stacking of positively charged \( \text{M}^{\text{II}}, \text{M}^{\text{III}} \)\( \text{OH} \)\(_2\) octahedral layers related to brucite. The sheets are bonded together via interlayer anions and water molecules. Low cost, easy preparation, and low toxic properties of \( \text{CaTi}_2\text{O}_4\)\( \text{OH} \)\(_2\) are its main advantages. Recently, \( \text{CaTi}_2\text{O}_4\)\( \text{OH} \)\(_2\) nanosheets have been shown to exhibit good electrical properties and facile to produce in large scale. [22–24]. Despite its economic advantages, according to our previous report, it is necessary to improve the material’s low conductivity to enhance energy conversion efficiency. Generating active sites and enhancing intrinsic conductivity in defect engineering of transition metal dichalcogenides have been regarded an effective method for improving electrochemical performance. To our knowledge, the partial substitution of Ti with other metals (e.g., Fe ions) was also worth exploring, as doping of Fe ions into \( \text{LiMn}_2\text{O}_4 \), \( \text{Li}_3\text{V}_2\text{(PO}_4\text{)}_3 \), and \( \text{Li}_2\text{Ti}_3\text{O}_7 \) have been shown to effectively enhance their electronic conductivity, due to formed vacancies. [25–27] In this paper, the effects of Fe ion doping on the electrochemical properties of \( \text{CaTi}_2\text{O}_4\)\( \text{OH} \)\(_2\) were examined.

2. EXPERIMENTAL

2.1. Synthesis of the samples

Titanium \( n \)‑butoxide (TBOT), ferric nitrate \( \text{Fe(NO}_3\text{)}_3\cdot9\text{H}_2\text{O} \), and calcium chloride \( \text{CaCl}_2 \) were chosen to form the precursor. The molar ratio of precursor \( \text{CaCl}_2/\text{TBOT/water/ethanol was} \) 1/1/100/10. For this, a TBOT-ethanol solution was added to an aqueous \( \text{CaCl}_2 \) and \( \text{Fe(NO}_3\text{)}_3\cdot9\text{H}_2\text{O} \) solution (Fe/Ti molar ratio \( x \) was 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, and 0.08), forming suspension A. After stirring for 10 min, 2.4 ml of 3 M \( \text{NaOH} \) was added to suspension A under vigorous stirring. Subsequently, the autoclave was sealed and heated to 200\(^\circ\)C for 24 h, followed by natural cooling to room temperature. The samples were thoroughly washed and dried at a vacuum oven at 80\(^\circ\)C for 24 h. The powders with various Fe ion doping concentrations were prepared, hereafter termed as \( \text{CaFe}_x\text{Ti}_{2-x}\text{(OH)}_2 \) \( (x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, \text{and} \ 0.08) \).

2.2. Characterization of the samples

Phases of samples were analyzed by X-ray diffraction (XRD; X’Pert Pro, Malvern Panalytical B.V., Almelo, The Netherlands) in a \( \theta \) range from 10 to 70\(^\circ\), using Cu-K\( \alpha \) radiation \( (\lambda = 0.15420 \text{ nm}) \). Sample microstructures were analyzed by a field emission scanning electron microscopy (FESEM; Hitachi S-4800, Hitachi High-Technologies Corp., Tokyo, Japan) and high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HRTEM, FEI Tecnai G2 F-30, FEI Co., Hillsboro, OR, USA) operating at an accelerating voltage of 200 kV to further characterize sample morphology. Sample surface areas were characterized using the Brunauer-Emmett-Teller (BET) method and pore sizes determined using the Barrett-Joyner-Halenda (BJH) method with the nitrogen branches of isotherms collected at 77 K on a TriStar II 3020 nitrogen adsorption apparatus (Micromeritics Instrument Corp., Norcross, GA, USA).
2.3. Electrochemical measurement of the samples

Working electrodes were prepared by coating a mixture of 85-wt% CaFe,Ti2-x(OH)2 sample, 10-wt% acetylene black, and 5-wt% poly(tetrafluoroethylene) onto nickel foam sheets. The electrolyte was 1 M LiPF6 (battery grade; Merck KGaA, Darmstadt, Germany) in a mixture of ethyl carbonate (EC) and diethyl carbonate (DMC, 1/1 by vol) on nickel foam sheets with a size of 1.5 × 1.5 cm and dried at 60°C (8.4 mg loading). Electrochemical properties were measured using CHI660C electrochemical analyzer system (Chenhua Instrument Corp., Shanghai, China) in a three-compartment cell with a working electrode, platinum plate counter electrode, and saturated calomel reference electrode (SCE). Galvanostatic charge-discharge was analyzed using a LAND CT2001A test system (Land electronics Co., Ltd., Wu Han, China).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Figure 1. XRD patterns of CaTi2O4(OH)2 samples prepared with different Fe-doped ions contents: (a) 0, (b) 0.02, (c) 0.04, (d) 0.06 and (e) 0.08.

XRD patterns of typical CaFe,Ti2-x(OH)2 samples (x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, and 0.08) showed that the peaks corresponded to CaTi2O4(OH)2 (JCPDS card 39-0357, Fig. 1). No other impurity peaks were observed, indicating that pure CaTi2O4(OH)2 had been obtained. Peak positions of doped samples were consistent with undoped samples, although sample peak intensities varied. The intensities of (040), (340), (331), (191), (371), and (402) for doped samples were much lower than those of undoped samples, which might be attributed to solid-solid interactions and altered grain size. [28] The sample lattice constants with various Fe-doped contents showed that the intensities of Fe-doped samples decreased with Fe-doped content and Fe ion peaks were not observed (Fig. 1). The average crystallite size of CaTi2-xFe2xO4(OH)2 samples with various x values was calculated using the XRD-Scherrer formula, $d = \frac{k\lambda}{\beta\cos\theta}$, where $d$ is the mean crystallite size, $k$ at -0.9, $\lambda$ the wavelength of Cu-Ka (e.g., $\lambda$ = 0.15420 nm), $\beta$ the full width at half maximum intensity of the peak (FWHM) in radians, and $\theta$ Bragg’s diffraction angle [28]. The lattice constants and cell volumes were calculated by direct methods and Fourier synthesis using the program SHELXS–97 (Program for Crystal Structure Solution and Refinement, University of Gottingen, Germany) [29]. The crystalline size and cell
volume were observed to decrease with increased \( x \) (Table 1), which indicated that Fe ions had inserted into the interlayer of CaTi\(_2\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\), due to the smaller ion radius of Fe\(^{3+}\) (0.69 Å), compared to Ti\(^{4+}\) (0.745 Å). When various Fe-doped ions contents were introduced, all diffraction peaks were seen to broaden to different degrees. These results indicated that Fe-doped ions might have lowered the crystal size of CaTi\(_2\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\), which was further confirmed by the following SEM and TEM results.

**Table 1.** Cell parameters and specific surface areas of CaFe\(_x\)Ti\(_{2-x}\)(OH)\(_2\) samples with various \( x \)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>( x ) (mol)</th>
<th>Crystalline size (nm)</th>
<th>Lattice constant/ Å</th>
<th>Cell volume Å(^3)</th>
<th>Specific surface areas (m(^2)/g)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>50.1</td>
<td>12.09277 31.65766 4.93451</td>
<td>1894.49</td>
<td>112.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>12.09280 31.66751 4.94257</td>
<td>1894.92</td>
<td>121.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>12.09283 31.69754 4.94856</td>
<td>1897.08</td>
<td>148.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>12.09287 31.69790 4.95939</td>
<td>1897.20</td>
<td>153.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Typical sample FESEM images showed that, compared with undoped samples, doped samples exhibited smaller sizes and some small particles observed (Table 1, Fig. 2). Typical images of an undoped sample showed many small, distributed nanosheets (Fig. 2a). When the Fe-doped content was 0.06 mol, the sample exhibited uniformly dispersed, small nanosheets. When \( x \) was 0.08, large agglomerates composed of dense nanosheet-like morphology appeared in the samples while well-dispersed nanosheets disappeared (Figs. 2e–2f), indicating that excessive Fe-doped content was harmful for the formation of high-quality nanosheet structures. This was attributed to the effect that Fe-doping ions made the nucleation process more difficult as clarified that the degree of crystallization decreases (Fig. 1).
Figure 2. FESEM images of the CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ sample prepared with different Fe-doped ions contents: (a) 0, (b) 0.02, (c) 0.04, (d) 0.06, (e) 0.08.

Typical TEM images and corresponding HRTEM patterns of CaFe$_x$Ti$_{2-x}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples with $x = 0$ and 0.06 showed that undoped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples were composed of many overlapped nanosheets of 5–7 nm thickness (Fig. 3a). HRTEM images of undoped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples showed that the lattice space was 0.1898 nm, which was in accordance with a lattice spacing of the (422) plane (Fig. 3b). TEM images of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples showed that most of the sample retained nanosheet-like structures with thicknesses of 3–5 nm and some nanoparticles coexisted, in which some mesopores formed (Fig. 3c). Although CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples retained the original flake structure, its thickness was smaller than that of undoped sample and filled with small pores, which was beneficial to ion adsorption from the electrolyte. Thus, the BET of the samples was observed to increase with $x$ (Table 1) and, thus, the samples’ electrochemical properties enhanced. After doping with Fe ions, CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ nanosheets also exhibited clear lattice fringes and the corresponding lattice spacing 0.1890 nm, which was accordance with a (422) plane (Fig. 3d).
The specific surface areas of CaFe\(_x\)Ti\(_{2-x}\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\) \((x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06,\) and 0.08) samples were 108.9, 113.6, 123.7, 148.7, and 56.3 \(\text{m}^2/\text{g}\), respectively (Table 1). Clearly, suitable Fe-doping enhanced the specific surface areas of CaTi\(_2\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\) samples to various degrees. Isotherms of typical samples showed that both samples exhibited distinct hysteresis loops, which was accordance with a type IV pattern, indicating their mesoporous structure that might have contributed to interspaces among CaTi\(_2\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\) nanosheets (Fig. 4). The pore size distribution of the typical samples revealed that, Fe-doped samples exhibited smaller size distributions, with mean pore diameters of ~6.8 nm, which was attributed to spaces between small CaTi\(_2\)O\(_4\)(OH)\(_2\) grains (Fig. 4, inset). Such a small mesoporous size distribution was conducive for electrolyte adsorption and diffusive ion transportation.
The oxidation states of Fe and Ti in CaFe_{0.06}Ti_{1.94}O_4(OH)_2 samples were studied using XPS. XPS Fe-2p and Ti-2p peaks for CaFe_{0.06}Ti_{1.94}O_4(OH)_2 clearly showed that two main peaks at -459.0 and 464.8 eV in the spectra, which were ascribed to Ti-2p^{3/2} and Ti-2p^{1/2}, respectively, corresponding to the Ti^{4+} oxidation state (Fig. 5). This might be attributed to spin-orbit splitting of Ti-2p. At the same time, the peak at ~710 eV matched well with an observed peak in Fe_2O_3, [30] where the two peaks at 711.1 and 724.7 eV were attributed to Fe-2p^{3/2} and Fe-2p^{1/2} (Fig. 5a), respectively. [27] In addition, the energy difference between Fe-2p^{3/2} and Fe-2p^{1/2} was 13.6 eV, which is typical for the Fe^{3+} state. Therefore, it was concluded that Fe ions doped into CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 existed in trivalent form, which indicated that some Fe^{3+} diffused into titania lattices and substituted for Ti^{4+} in the lattice. After Fe^{3+} (0 < x ≤ 0.06) partially replaced Ti^{4+}, Fe doped CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 samples had a smaller lattice parameter. Fe^{3+} ions located in pseudotetrahedral sites in TiO_2-layers or in square-pyramidal sites (in CaO-layers) formed with the participation of oxygen vacancies [31]. Fe ion stabilization on CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 lattices might have been due to the smaller Fe^{3+} ion radius than that of Ti^{4+} (0.69 and 0.745 Å, respectively), which enhanced the attractive action between central cations and oxygen anions and, thus, enhanced the stability of nanosheet-like structures to ion absorption/desorption. Fe-doped CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 samples with x at 0.02, 0.04, and 0.06 mol exhibited much better electrochemical properties than undoped CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2, which was attributed to the solid solution formation of Fe^{3+} ion replacement of Ti^{4+}, which resulted in lattice distortion and a certain amount of oxygen vacancy in the sample, due to the imbalance of electricity values. After further doping Fe ions to 0.08 mol, there was a continuous redistribution of Fe^{3+} ions, which thus caused axial stresses in the layers. Fe cluster formation was harmful for the electrochemical properties of CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2. Based on CV results, the electrode reaction reversibility was improved with the appropriate Fe-doping of CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2.

Figure 5. High-resolution XPS survey of CaFe_{0.06}Ti_{1.94}O_4(OH)_2: (a) Fe 2p, (b) Ti 2p.

CV curves of electrodes prepared from CaFe_{x}Ti_{2-x}O_4(OH)_2 samples (x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, and 0.08) showed that areas surrounded by CV curves and peak currents of doped samples were much larger than those of undoped samples, indicating that all Fe-doped CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 samples exhibited larger discharge capacities than those of undoped samples (Fig. 6a). Interestingly, CV curve shapes after Fe-doped CaTi_2O_4(OH)_2 samples were almost unchanged, which indicated that Fe-doped
CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ did not change the material’s structure and also indicated the electrochemical reaction process for the phase transformation and redox couple. However, the cathodic peaks all shifted to lower potentials and then the potential differences between anodic and cathodic peaks became smaller, indicating an improvement in electrode reaction reversibility. Moreover, the symmetry of redox peaks from Fe-doped samples was observed to be relatively higher than that of undoped ones, which indicated that sample capacity stability was enhanced after Fe doping. Charge-discharge curves of CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes in the range of 0–0.5 V at 10 mA·cm$^{-2}$ are shown in Figure 6b. Based on the data in Figure 6(a), the specific capacitance was calculated according to equation (1)

$$C = \frac{I \Delta t}{m \Delta \nu} \quad (1)$$

where $I$ is the charge or discharge current (A), $m$ the mass of active material in the electrode (mg), $\Delta \nu$ the voltage difference between the upper and lower potential limits (V), $\Delta t$ the charge or discharge time (s), and $C$ the specific capacitance (F·g$^{-1}$). The specific capacitance of CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes prepared from CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples ($x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, 0.08$), calculated from the discharge curves, were 287.3, 498.9, 810.9, 964.3, and 351.2 F·g$^{-1}$ at the discharge current of 10 mA·cm$^{-2}$, respectively. CaTi$_{1.94}$Fe$_{0.06}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes possessed a larger specific capacitance than those of Fe-doped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes at each current density, which was consistent with their CV results.

![Figure 6](image_url)

**Figure 6.** (a) The cyclic voltammogram (CV) curves and (b) the charge-discharge curves of the electrode samples prepared from CaTi$_{2-x}$Fe$_x$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples ($x = 0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, 0.08$)

Nyquist plots of the optimal CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrode and an original sample, in the range of 1–1000 kHz, showed that these impedance spectra exhibited high frequency semicircles and low frequency tails, suggesting a double layer reaction at electrode/sample interfaces and ion diffusion in the solid matrices (Fig. 7). In the high frequency region, both samples were seen to exhibit similar semicircles, corresponding to the charge-transfer resistance.[31] Compared to the undoped sample, the charge-transfer resistance (Rct) of Fe-doped samples decreased. Combined with XRD, HRTEM, and the decreased cell volumes of Fe-doped samples results (Table 1), the small grain sizes and pores of Fe-doped samples were concluded to provide more channels and interface between electrode and electrolyte for fast ion and charge transport. The straight line in the low frequency region was ascribed to Warburg impedance. [32] Resistance values of undoped samples were ~75 Ω·cm$^2$, whereas the
semicircle was smaller and resistance values thus lower after doping with Fe ions. This indicated that Fe doped samples had faster charge transfer at the electrode-electrolyte interface, compared to without doping. An equivalent electrical circuit model for illustrating impedance spectra was proposed here, which was composed of electrolyte resistance ($R_s$), charge-transfer resistance ($R_{ct}$), double layer capacitance, a constant phase element (CPE), with Warburg impedance ($Z_w$) attributed to ion diffusion in the matrix (Fig. 7d, inset). In this, the $R_{ct}$ of all Fe-doped samples was smaller than that of undoped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes, which might have been ascribed to Fe doping in the CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrode. The $R_{ct}$ of the CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ cathode was the smallest at 2.41 $\Omega$·cm$^2$. This indicated that the resistance of Fe-doped CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes was reduced by increased conductivity. CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples exhibited a combination of Ti$^{4+}$/Ti$^{3+}$ redox couples at relatively low potential, which significantly induced irreversibility of these electrodes. [23–24]

**Figure 7.** The typical Nyquist plots of the electrodes made from the as-prepared CaTi$_{2-x}$Fe$_x$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples (x=0, 0.02, 0.04, 0.06, 0.08). Inset of Fig. 7 is equivalent circuit model.

Representative CV curves of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes at various scan rates and from 10 to 70 mV·s$^{-1}$ showed that redox peak currents increased with the scan rate, suggesting rapid reversible redox reactions on CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ during the charge/discharge process (Fig. 8a). Moreover, anodic peak potentials increased and cathodic potentials decreased with high scan rates. The galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes are shown in Figure 8b. The specific capacitances of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ electrodes, calculated from discharge curves based on equation (1), were 964.3, 736.6, 582.6, and 519.0 F·g$^{-1}$ at charge-discharge current densities of 10, 20, 50, and 100 mA·cm$^{-2}$, respectively. The decreased specific capacitances could have contributed to the insufficient Faradic redox reactions at higher current densities.[33] The cycling behavior of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ is shown in Figure 8c and the capacity observed to clearly increase in the first 100 cycles, which might have been because of electrode materials utilization activation. The specific capacities keep almost unchanged and remained 99.7% even after 5000 cycles, indicating a good candidate for supercapacitor application. To further understand the performance of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ for electrochemical energy storage, the columbic efficiency of the sample is analyzed (Fig. 8(d)). During the cyclic process, the columbic efficiency is 92%, indicating a good
capacity retention. Further demonstrating the practical application of our samples, the best optimum \( \text{CaFe}_{0.06}\text{Ti}_{1.94}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) electrode materials were assembled in CR2025-type coin cells. After charging for a short time, the sample device can easily power for a light-emitting diodes as shown in inset of Fig. 8(d), which indicates its future in practical application for supercapicators.

**Figure 8.** (a) the representative CV curves of the synthesized \( \text{CaFe}_{0.06}\text{Ti}_{1.94}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) electrodes within the potential range of 0 to 0.5 V (vs. SCE) at various scan rates from 10 to 70 mV s\(^{-1}\); (b) The galvanostatic charge-discharge curves of the synthesized \( \text{CaFe}_{0.06}\text{Ti}_{1.94}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) electrodes in the voltage range of 0-0.5 V at charge-discharge current densities of 10 mA cm\(^{-2}\), 20 mA cm\(^{-2}\), 40 mA cm\(^{-2}\), 50 mA cm\(^{-2}\) and 100 mA cm\(^{-2}\); (c) the cyclic stability of the synthesized \( \text{CaFe}_{0.06}\text{Ti}_{1.94}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) electrodes at a current density of 10 mA cm\(^{-2}\); (d) the columbic efficiency of the \( \text{CaFe}_{0.06}\text{Ti}_{1.94}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) sample. Inset of Fig. 8 (d) is the sample device easily powering for a light-emitting diodes after charging for a short time.

**Figure 9.** XRD patterns of the \( \text{CaTi}_{1.94}\text{Fe}_{0.06}\text{O}_4\text{(OH)}_2 \) sample after 100 charge/discharge cycles.
XRD patterns of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ samples after 100 charge/discharge cycles showed that the patterns were similar to the original samples, indicating that the samples could recycle even after many charge/discharge cycles (Fig. 9). Only the peaks of the sample became broadened, indicating active materials pulverization during long-term cycles.

The present results demonstrated that CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ had the highest conductivity and possessed optimal electrochemical properties, which was attributed to morphological effects enhancing electrochemical activities [34] and smaller particles size that more easily accommodated structural changes during the cycling process.[35] In addition, the existence of Fe ions resulted in some local defects in the crystal structure, and thus increased electrical conductivity and ionic diffusion. Therefore, the cyclic performances of the CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ system were apparently improved after introducing small amounts of Fe-doped ions. Complete clarification of Fe doping effects in the CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ system requires further investigation.

Comparison of the electrochemical properties of similar electrode materials for supercapacitors reported in the literature and investigated here showed that, compared with many previous reports, CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ nanosheets had high capacity and superior rate capability (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Electrode materials</th>
<th>Specific capacity</th>
<th>Rate performance</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Polypyrrole/MnO$_2$ on carbon cloth</td>
<td>325 F g$^{-1}$ at 0.2 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>70% at a high current density of 5.0 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>[12]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co$_3$O$_4$/reduced graphene oxide nanosheet composites</td>
<td>400 F g$^{-1}$ at 0.5-2.0 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesoporous weirds-like morphological MnO$_2$ thin films on carbon cloth</td>
<td>595 F g$^{-1}$ at a scan rate of 5 mV s$^{-1}$</td>
<td>87% over 2,000 CV cycles</td>
<td>[17]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graphene nanosheet(GNS)/kassite (CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$) composites</td>
<td>129.8 F g$^{-1}$ at 1 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[22]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N-doped graphene/Fe$_2$O$_3$ nanocomposite</td>
<td>698 F g$^{-1}$ at 1 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>55% retention after 3000 cycles at 4 A g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>[32]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CaFe$<em>{0.06}$Ti$</em>{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ nanosheet</td>
<td>964.3 F g$^{-1}$</td>
<td>99.7% retention after 5000 cycles at 10 mA cm$^{-2}$</td>
<td>This work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4. CONCLUSIONS

In summary, CaFe$_x$Ti$_{2-x}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ materials were successfully prepared by a simple solvothermal method. The results showed that sample electrochemical properties were enhanced after Fe ion doping into CaTi$_2$O$_4$(OH)$_2$. Electrochemical cells prepared with CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ cathode materials exhibited higher discharge capacity and better cyclic stability than undoped versions and other Fe-doped systems. The optimal composition of CaFe$_{0.06}$Ti$_{1.94}$O$_4$(OH)$_2$ presented 964.3 F·g$^{-1}$ at a current
density of 10 mA·cm⁻², 99.7% retention rate after 5000 cycles, and low charge-transfer resistance (2.41 Ω·cm²). A suitable amount of Fe doping in CaTi₂O₅(OH)₂ system was successful for enhancing electrochemical properties by improving structural stability and electrical conductivity. The results of this study will contribute to furthering the applications of these materials in supercapacitors and also meaningful to future research.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS
This work was supported by the major Natural Science Fund of Jiangxi Province (20152ACB21022) and National Natural Science Fund (51562013).

References


© 2019 The Authors. Published by ESG (www.electrochemsci.org). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).